

Additional Discussion Points

[Text in this format and color is my sastra yukti (Scriptural logic) based on my understanding after reading these sections, reading of scriptures and discussing with various devotees specially HH Bhanu Swami Maharaja. Theses may be accepted at the level of anumāna pramān]

1. Further proof of Prtirupa forms(Demigod Counterparts) being amsa(expansion) of Nitya Siddha Jivas

Srimad Bhagavatam 10.3.45

Translation*

Both of you, husband and wife, constantly think of Me as your son, but always know that I am the Supreme Personality of Godhead. By thus thinking of Me constantly with love and affection, you will achieve the highest perfection: returning home, back to Godhead.

[*Lord is directly addressing Vasudev and Devaki and indirectly addressing their expansions – this is understood from previous shlokas which speak about their undergoing austerity etc.]

Sanatana Goswami - 10.3.45

yady adhikārānte'ditikaśyapayoḥ parama-pada-prāptyaiva tad *amśayor* anayos
tat-prāptis

Though Aditi and Kaśyapa will attain the highest goal after being qualified,
they attained it as your expansions.

tathāpi yuvām yāsyetha iti janmāntarābhāva-mātre tātparyam /

Now you will attain the goal, without another birth.

Sanatana Goswami - 10.3.45

yad vā, śrī-devakī-vasudevāvibhāveva nitya-vaikuṅṭha-mukhya-pārṣadāvetayor evāṁśau tau, ata evoktam - tvam eva pūrva-saṅge'bhūḥ pṛśniḥ [bhā.pu. 10.3.32] ity-ādi

Or Vasudeva and Devakī are eternal associates in Vaikuṅṭha whereas Aditi and Kaśyapa are expansions*.

tvam eva pūrva-sarge 'bhūḥ pṛśniḥ svāyambhuve sati

tadāyaṁ sutapā nāma prajāpatir akalmaṣah

The Supreme Lord replied: My dear mother, best of the chaste, in your previous birth, in the Svāyambhuva millennium, you were known as Pṛśni, and Vasudeva, who was the most pious Prajāpati, was named Sutapā. (SB 10.3.32)

[*expansion is not meant in the sense of empowered jiva here but literally amsa hence they are not different souls]

2. Is Gaura, Kṛṣṇa with Rādhā's mood or Rādhā-Kṛṣṇa combined?* → ?

Answer by HH Sivaram Swami Maharaja: Radha bhava dyuti... Chaitanya Charitamrita and Srila Prabhupada say Lord Caitanya is Kṛṣṇa but he has the bhava of Radharani. Kṛṣṇa is the source of Radharani. Ekatmana bhuvī pura deha bhedaṁ... this seems they have become one. They have become one in the sense that Kṛṣṇa has adopted the mood of Radharani. Mood means being absorbed in that identity. Kṛṣṇa wants to enjoy being the ashraya or shelter of Love rather than visaya. His "Kṛṣṇa" identity is completely covered by the identity of Radharani and complexion. He and Radharani are combined but that's not how he conducts ... Radha has separated and become two and that's the mood or consciousness in which Lord Caitanya functions. Lord Caitanya is Kṛṣṇa but in the mood of Radharani. Real key to understand Lord Caitanya is the idea of Radha bhava. When we have identity of someone else then in fact you are that person. Sometimes he was more in that mood in night and sometimes less. But he was at heart in the mood of Radharani. It is inconceivable and it is like that.

[This answer also hints at "How is Lord Caitanya non different than Kṛṣṇa although with a different mood and complexion?"]

Different kinds of expansions and merging we have already read about

1. Sadhaka merging in body of Nitya Siddha(Ex: Brahmā Mahātapah and Prahlad Maharaja)
2. One Nitya Siddha present in different bodies(Ex: Tungavidya as Vidyavacaspati and Prabhodananda Saraswati) during a pastime.
3. Mutltiple Nitya Siddhas in one body(Ex: Lalita Sakhi, Arjuniya Gopi and Pandava Arjuna in Ramananda Raya)
4. Nitya siddha merging with their amsas(Ex: Vasudev, Sutapa and Kashyapa merge)
5. Visnu tattva and Jiva tattva merging(Ex: Jiva tattva sesa merging in Lakshmana)
6. Krishna and His eternal associates being in mood of Asraya and Sadhaka resp. in Goloka and Svetadvipa.

Few more are -

1. Svakiya Gopis merging in Parakiya Gopis for respective pastimes in Bhauma Vrindavana. (quoted in KS)
2. Yogamaya creating expansions of original Gopis who intimately associated with Gopas (husbands). Original Gopis remained unaware of the existence of such expansions. (quoted in Krishna Sangati)

And much more permutation and
combination is possible
which we can't even think of
and comprehend...

But, before we conclude...

Q. Ramananda Raya is the incarnation of Lalita-gopi, Arjuniya-gopi, and Pandava Arjuna
(Gaura Ganoddesa Dipika)

1. Does this mean that Ramananda Raya and Lalita gopi are same personality but exist
simultaneously in both Goloka and Svetadvipa?

2. Arjuniya Gopi and Pandava Arjuna are also Nitya siddhas but different personalities?

3. Arjuniya Gopi and Pandava Arjuna only merge with Lalita Gopi during the Bhauma
Caitanya lila?

Answer by HHBSM: we have no explanations of this so all we can do is speculate.

Following is an excerpt from Krishna Sangati to conclude this topic -

Quote from Introduction to Krishna Sangati by HH Sivaram Swami Mahraja

Kṛṣṇa and his divine potency Yogamāyā act like the producer and director of Kṛṣṇa's pastime dramas,
in which Kṛṣṇa is also the star. And Yogamāyā manages all the backup services needed for the
performances—scripting, casting, editing, selecting locations, arranging props, and so on—inspired by
the producer and star of the show, Śrī Kṛṣṇa. Both producer and director are inconceivably innovative,
having unlimited resources and abilities to manipulate those resources. [That Yogamāyā performs
inconceivable feats is a statement about the limitation of the observer of those feats. But for Kṛṣṇa (and
Yogamāyā), because everything is within their grasp, nothing is inconceivable, and there are no
limitations. Śrīla Baladeva Vidyābhūṣaṇa elaborates on this truth in his commentary on Vedānta-sūtra
2.2.32: sampatter iti jaiminis tathā hi darśayati. In brief, Baladeva says that contradictory qualities
like being one and being many, being the size of a thumb and at the same time the source of universes,
being knowledge and yet having a body, and so on, appear contradictory only to the observer.

Quote from Introduction to Krishna Sangati by HH Sivaram Swami Mahraja

But for Kṛṣṇa, contradiction is neither a restriction nor an inconsistency, for all such contradictions are resolved in him by his inconceivable potencies] Nothing is beyond the means of Yogamāyā. She manifests Kṛṣṇa's associates, the entourage of actors who perform on two stages—the material and spiritual worlds. The mystic potencies of Yogamāyā provide the special effects, which empower the actors with supernatural skills. All members of this transcendental drama troupe can expand themselves into other persons, merge with and separate from each other as needed, play different roles in different dramas on different stages—and they can do all these things in different places at the same time.

Finally, at the completion of yet another flawless performance, as the curtain falls, the drama starts again, without missing a beat. And the producer, director, and actors—including the star—from the very beginning of the new performance have already forgotten their previous one. Thus, they restart the show with full gusto, adding ever-fresh variations and nuances to the eternal story-line.

A Discussion on
Ordinary Demigods and
Nitya Siddha Demigods

(from Bhakti Rasāmrita Sindhu)

Definition of Ashraya Alambana(Devotee eligible to experience Rasa)

||2.1.273|| Translation: The devotees of Kṛṣṇa:

Those whose hearts are full of attraction for Kṛṣṇa are called the devotees of Kṛṣṇa*.

Jīva Gosvāmī's Commentary: Those whose hearts (svāntāḥ) are infused with (bhāvita) the most excellent rati (bhāva) for Kṛṣṇa as their object of love are called kṛṣṇa-bhaktas. This means that they are the ālambana (āśraya), special great devotees attracted to the form of Kṛṣṇa in a particular mood, to whom Kṛṣṇa is similarly attracted.

[*HH Bhanu Swami Maharaja Footnote: Here the description of the āśraya starts.]

[All Ashraya Alambana described in the book have Rati(bhava) to experience Rasa.]

Dasya Rasa (Transcendental Affection - Servitude)

Ālambana: ||3.2.18|| Translation: The four types of dāsas are the adhikṛta, āśrita, pāriṣada and anuga.

||3.2.19|| Translation: The wise say that Brahmā, Śaṅkara, Indra and others are called adhikṛta (appointed) dāsas. Since their forms are well known, only their bhakti will be described.

Jīva Gosvāmī's Commentary: Adhikṛta means "one who is appointed to a post by the Lord."

Srila Prabhupada(NOD ch. 36): The devotees of the Lord in servitude are divided into four classes: appointed servants (such as Lord Brahmā and Lord Śiva, who are appointed to control the material modes of passion and ignorance), devotees in servitude who are protected by the Lord, devotees who are always associates and devotees who are simply following in the footsteps of the Lord.

[Adhikṛta dāsas refers to appointed demigods with Bhava or Prema not Nitya Siddha/Pratirupa demigods – implied from BRS and Q & A with HHBSM(quoted in future slides). Not all appointed devatas are dāsas(who naturally have Bhava or Prema being ālambana). Devata Brahma is not affected by material modes and seems to be counted as dāsa having heard Chatuh śloki from the Lord in his first kalpa itself . Brahma bewildered by her daughter is not the current Brahma (Srimad Bhagavatam 2.8.28 & 2.9.39) In some kalpas jiva is appointed to the role of Śiva as explained in Madhurya Kadambini ch 3 hence could have bhava/prema as a jiva tattva. Case of Indra is discussed later]

NOD ch. 36 continued...

Example of Adhikṛta : In a conversation between Jāmbavatī, one of Kṛṣṇa's wives, and Kālindī, her friend, Jāmbavatī inquired, "Who is this personality circumambulating our Kṛṣṇa?"

Kālindī replied, "She is Ambikā, the superintendent of all universal affairs."

Then Jāmbavatī inquired, "Who is this personality who is trembling at the sight of Kṛṣṇa?"

Kālindī replied, "He is Lord Śiva."

Then Jāmbavatī inquired, "Who is the person offering prayers?"

Kālindī replied, "He is Lord Brahmā."

Jāmbavatī then asked, "Who is that person who has fallen on the ground and is offering respect to Kṛṣṇa?"

Kālindī replied, "He is Indra, the king of heaven."

Jāmbavatī next inquired, "Who is this person who has come with the demigods and is laughing with them?"

Kālindī replied, "He is my elder brother, Yamarāja, the superintendent of death."

This conversation offers a description of all the demigods, including Yamarāja, who are engaged in services appointed by the Lord. They are called adhikṛta-devatā, or demigods appointed to particular types of departmental service*.

*[*Sriḷa Prabhupada clearly hints that the adhikṛta-devatās are demigods handling universal affairs]*

Jīva Gosvāmī's Commentary

This is an example of the *adhikṛtas*. *Kā paryeti* means “who is circumambulating the Lord.” *Kaḥ stabdhaḥ* means “who is stunned with the *sāttvika bhāva* called *stambha*.”

Since the actual Yama in charge for the Manvantara period had taken up the body of Vidura, Yama here refers to Aryamā who took the post temporarily*.

[*This seems to be a description at the time Krishna had appeared in his *svayam rupa* form in Bhauma Vrindavana 5000 years ago]

Second type of Dasa from BRS

||3.2.21|| *Āśrita*: There are three types of *āśritas*: those who have surrendered to the Lord as their protector (*śāraṇya*), those who were previously *jñānīs* (*jñāni-cara*) but later understood the superiority of the form and qualities of the Lord), and those who are fixed in service (*sevā-niṣṭhā*), (appreciating the Lord's sweetness).

||3.2.23|| *Śaraṇyas*: Kāliya and the kings kept in prison by Jarāsandha are examples *śaraṇyas*.

||3.2.26|| *Jñāni-caras*: The sages headed by Śaunaka who gave up the desire for liberation and surrendered to the Lord are called *jñāni-caras* by the wise.

BRS ||3.2.29|| Sevā-niṣṭhās: Those who from the beginning are attached to serving the Lord
are called sevā-niṣṭhā, fixed in service. (mūlato bhajanāsaktāḥ sevā-niṣṭhā itīritāḥ)

Examples are Candradhvaja (Siva) Indra (Harihaya), King Bahulāśva, Ikṣvāku, Śrutadeva
and Puṇḍarīka.

Srila Prabhupada NOD - Those who are from the very beginning of their self-realization
attached to devotional service are called sevā-niṣṭha. Sevā-niṣṭha means "simply attached
to devotional service." The best examples of such devotees are Lord Śiva, King Indra,
King Bahulāśva, King Ikṣvāku, Śrutadeva and Puṇḍarīka.

[It seems Sevā-niṣṭhās are Nitya Siddha Demigods who are either in Vaikuntha or are
Pratirupa expansions in Svarga – implied from BRS and Q & A with HHBSM]

Expression of Sattvika Bhavas and Sancari Bhavas by Indra

Sattvika Bhava - Vaivarnya (change of color)

BRS ||2.3.50|| From fear: When the inhabitants of Vraja were protected by Kṛṣṇa, the enemy of Baka, as He lifted the huge mountain casually, the *face of Indra turned black*. This indicated the fear in his mind.

Sancari Bhava - Vrīdā (shyness)

BRS ||2.4.115|| Shame arising from doing forbidden actions:

O Indra! *You should not hang down your head in shame* and remain silent. Take the *parijāta* tree and go. Otherwise how can you show your face to your wife?

[There are similar expressions about Brahma in BRS]

Expression of Sattvika Bhavas and Sancari Bhavas in Demigods

Excerpt from NOD chapter 29

Doubt (Sancari Bhava) –

After Lord Brahmā had stolen all of the calves, cows and cowherd boys from Kṛṣṇa, he was trying to go away. But all of a sudden he became doubtful about his stealing affairs and began to watch on all sides with his eight eyes. Lord Brahmā has four heads, and therefore he has eight eyes. *This is an instance of ecstatic love in doubt, caused by stealing.*

Excerpt from NOD chapter 29 continued...

Similarly, just to please Kṛṣṇa, Akrūra stole the Syamantaka maṇi, a stone which can produce unlimited quantities of gold, but later on he repented his stealing. *This is another instance of ecstatic love for Kṛṣṇa in doubt caused by stealing.*

When the King of heaven, Indra, was causing torrents of rain to fall on the land of Vraja, he was advised to surrender himself at the lotus feet of Kṛṣṇa. *At that time Indra's face became very dark because of doubt*.*

*[*Sri Prabhupada doesn't particularly mention Indra being in ecstasy (like the other two) but his ecstatic condition should be concluded due to appearance of Sancari Bhava.]*

Q. The demigods like Indra and Siva are mentioned in both adhikrta as well as seva nistha categories. One is appointed servant and other is fixed in service. Does this indicate they are different personalities?

Answer by HHBSM: there are those in Vaikuntha as well as those in this world. perhaps they are differently described.

Q. So should we conclude that these (personalities having vyabhicari bhavas) are not ordinary demigods (who are mixed devotees) but pratirupa forms of Nitya siddha Indra and other demigods?

Answer by HHBSM: possibly, though Goswamis never mention it

Q. That means such Vyabhicari bhavas are expressed only for Demigods in Vaikuntha or Prtirupa forms of demigods and not for Ordinary Demigods who are mixed devotees. This is what it looks like. Correct Maharaja?

Answer by HHBSM: vyabhicari bhavas can appear in bhava as well as prema. some devatas may have bhava as well.*

[*It seems that such expressions of ecstasy are not possible for ordinary devatas without Bhava or Prema.]

Q. Do demigods have Prema?

Answer by HH Sivarama Swami Maharaja: Few demigods have prema but not most among 33 crore devatas. Manigrew and Nalakuvera got prema from Kṛṣṇa. But, what kind of prema did they get? No reference I have seen.

The demigods and wives appeared on Kṛṣṇa's order and lived in Dvaraka along with wives. Very few were gopis, but generally they appeared among the Yadus and associated with the Nitya Siddha devotees like Rukmini, Pradyumna and others. They had the vision of Krishna as Paramatma. They had prema similar to Yōgis who attain by perfect meditation on Supersoul. Those in Vrindavan were elevated by the association of Gopis and Krishna's mercy.

Sun God is Narayana and full in prema. He is Supreme Personality of Godhead. There are different demigods who may acquired different types of prema. In conclusion, mostly demigods don't have prema and few do and have a variety of prema.

Conclusive points from this discussion

- All Ashraya Alambana described in BRS have Rati(bhava) and experience Rasa.
- Generally dasās who are adhikṛta devatas refers to appointed demigods with Bhava or Prema. (NOD ch. 36)
- It seems Sevā-niṣṭhās are Nitya Siddha Demigods who are either in Vaikuntha or are Prtirupa expansions in Svarga.
- The Demigods like Indra and Brahma express Sattvika Bhavas and Sancari Bhavas (BRS)
- Such expressions of ecstasy are not possible for ordinary devatas without Bhava or Prema.
Hence this is generally applicable for Sevā-niṣṭhās (Nitya Siddha/Prtirupa Demigods) or Adhikṛta Devatas with Bhava or Prema.

Indra (Ordinary Demigod without Bhava or Prema) described during Govardhan Līlā

SVCT - 10.27.8

Indra in great fear speaks. "You are the most famous father and guru. Because you
are most merciful and forgiving you can forgive the offense of this ignorant person
(avidusah) immersed in the ocean of power and forgetting your powers....you
should mercifully correct my bad tendency so that my animal tendencies do not
arise again." *Indra does not make this prayer with a completely pure heart,* for he
shows submissiveness in order to save himself. In the seventh verse he mentions
this. Then later, at the time of Kṛṣṇa stealing the parijata flower and other
pastimes, *he again forgets and commits the same mistake.*

...even though I knew (viduṣaḥ) your powers, I committed offense. Thus the offense is greater. But you should forgive me because I forgot (mūḍha-cetaṣaḥ) about your powers. You should not consider offenses committed out of ignorance. Since you have descended to benefit the universe and are the crest jewel of mercy and generosity, it is insignificant for you to forgive my offense which was committed only once. You should forgive me since I will never again offend you or your devotees (maivaṁ punar). I have the mentality of being an offender to you and your devotees (asatī matiḥ), and I was without knowledge (mūḍha-cetaṣaḥ).

Since I am not capable, how can such offense not occur again? But you can forgive: O person
who is capable of doing this (īśa) even though I am an offender! *This is the prayer of a person*
*who is not too pure in heart**. He realizes his incapability as expressed in the previous verse:
being fearful of you only when I am fearful (kale tvam bhayaṁ vīkṣya). *He will again forget*
when Kṛṣṇa takes the pārijāta tree.

[*The Indra mentioned in this pastime seems to be affected by material modes often(not as an
exception) and explained to have impure heart. He doesn't seem to have attained Bhava or Prema
and hence can't have genuine Sattvika or Vyabhicari bhavas.][MK shower 3: The conscious beings
who are dependent on the Lord, jivas, are of two types: those who are not covered by ignorance
(4 kumaras, Brahma) and those who are covered(devatas, men and animals).]

So, which Indra was present

actually at the time of

Bhauma Vrindavan Pastimes

5000 years ago?

- a. Nitya Siddha Indra
- b. Pratirupa Indra(amsa of Nitya Siddha Indra)
- c. Ordinary Indra(with Bhava/Prema)
- d. Ordinary Indra(without Bhava/Prema)
- e. All of them

Q. Maharaja it seems that for the current Manvantara(while Kṛṣṇa was present 5000 years ago) we have 2 descriptions of Indra



1. Indra with Bhava/Prema - Described in BRS as adhikṛta dasa(appointed as King of Heaven, According to SP in NoD ch 36).
2. Indra with impure heart(affected by false ego and 3 modes and forgetful of Krishna's supreme position on multiple occasions like Govardhan Lila and Parijata tree Lila)

So, Maharaja both the Indras are described to be present 5000 years ago while Krishna was present on earth. Maharaja assuming that both the Indras can't be same soul should we reconcile that Prtirupa Indra has merged with Devata Indra and each one manifests different pastime at different times as being in one body?

Answer by HHBSM: We can just say that Indra acted in this manner by will of the Lord as in the case of Brahma stealing the cows.

Although the glories of Lord Kṛṣṇa and His associates
are unlimited, through this presentation I have tried
to bring out some understanding based on scriptural
proofs and sections that I came across and found
relevant. Surely there are many more things which
should be included in this discussion to bring out
proper conclusions.