

**LESSONS 11 & 12, TEXTS 56-60:
PARIṆĀMA-VĀDA VERSUS VIVARTA-VĀDA**

**LESSON 17, TEXT 74-81: THE
CAUSE EXISTS INDEPENDENT
OF ITS EFFECT**

**LESSONS 13 & 14, TEXTS 61-69:
EVERYTHING IS NON-
DIFFERENT FROM PARAMĀTMA**

**LESSON 11-17, TEXTS 56-81:
COSMIC MANIFESTATION OF
MĀYĀ & ITS
RELATIONSHIP
WITH PARAMĀTMA**

**LESSON 16,
TEXT 71-73:
MANIFEST &
UNMANIFEST
STATES OF
THE UNIVERSE**

**LESSON 15,
TEXT 70:
PARIṆĀMA-
VĀDA**

LESSONS 11 & 12, TEXTS 56-60: PARIṆĀMA-VĀDA VERSUS VIVARTA-VĀDA

- JīvaG strongly refutes the theory of Māyāvādīs that the cosmos is a mere illusory manifestation—the **vivarta-vāda**. It is a result (**pariṇāma**), or modification of the bahiraṅgā-śakti, or extrinsic potency of Paramātmā—**pariṇāma-vāda** ⇒ The cosmos
- On the authority of the Bhāgavatam, he establishes that the cosmos is a real effect of the real potency of Paramātmā.
- **Vivarta-vāda**: It is Brahman who appears as the cosmos thru the agency of Māyā, just as a rope appears as a snake in semi-darkness—so it is a misperception ∴ cosmos is not real. But we do feel the reality of cosmos. So the radical Advaitavādīs postulate that the cosmos is like a rope mistaken for a snake. Despite illusory perception, it can elicit fear in the mind of the beholder ∴ it is only an empirical reality to the world, but not ontological reality.

- **Pariṇāma-vāda** philosophy: JīvaG reasons that the cosmos is NOT unreal (mithyā), because it is non-distinct from its real source, Paramātmā. It is real, but undergoes cycles of manifestation and unmanifestation, in the form of creation and dissolution. Even in the state of dissolution, the cosmos still exists in its unmanifest form within Paramātmā.
- But then how to account for the immutability of Paramātmā. He is not only as the instrumental cause of the cosmos (nimitta), but also as its constituent cause (upādāna). This would seem to negate His immutability.
- JīvaG's resolution: The part that undergoes modification, Māyā, is extrinsic to Paramātmā's essential nature. At the same time, Māyā is non-different from Him—the acintya-bheda-abheda doctrine

TEXTS 56 & 57: THE GENERATION OF THE MATERIAL UNIVERSE

- ततस्तेनानुविद्धेभ्यो युक्तेभ्योऽण्डमचेतनम्।
- उत्थितं पुरुषो यस्मादुदतिष्ठदसौ विराट् ॥
- एतदण्डं विशेषाख्यमं क्रमवृद्धैर्दशोत्तरैः।
- तोयादिभिः परिवृतं प्रधानेनावृतैर्बहिः।
- यत्र लोकवितानोऽयं रूपं भगवतो हरेः ॥

“Thereafter, from these [mahat and so on], which were impelled and united by the presence of Paramātmā, appeared an inert egg, called viśeṣa, is surrounded by layers of water, fire, air, ether,

ego, and the mahat-tattva, each ten times larger than the previous. All these are enveloped by the outer, most layer of pradhāna. Within this egg is found the expansion of the various planetary systems., which is a form of Bhagavān Śrī Hari Himself. [3.26.51-52] **JīvaG**: An insentient egg (aṇḍa) was generated from mahat and the other elements, which were precipitated (अनुविद्धेभ्यो), by Paramātmā. From that egg appeared this Cosmic Person, the **विराट-पुरुष**.

- The universe is manifested by Paramātmā from Pradhāna.
- Until Paramātmā personally entered within them, all the various tattvas that formed remained unconnected ⇒ united in the shape of an inert egg ⇒ Cosmic Person, the Virāt Puruṣa. He is also called the gross form of Hiraṇyagarbha, who contains the aggregate of all the Jīvas.
- The egg-shaped universe is surrounded by earth, water, fire, air, space, mahat, and pradhāna, each covering being ten times thicker than the previous one.
- Next, JīvaG explains the universe itself, although sometimes referred to as the form of Bhagavān, it is NOT Bhagavān; rather, it is of material nature.

■ TEXT 57: THE UNIVERSE IS MATERIAL

अमुनी भगवद्रूपे मया ते ह्यनुवर्णिते ।
उभे अपि न गृह्णति मायासृष्टे विपश्चितः ॥

- Śuka: “These two forms of Bhagavān, which I have described to you, are a creation of Māyā, so the wise [विपश्चितः] accept neither of them [as suitable for worship].” [2.10.35]
- अमुनी means these two—the individual and collective bodies, gross and subtle, synonymous with Virāṭ Puruṣa & Hiraṇyagarbha, which constitute the universe and superimposed onto Bhagavān. However, this description is meant for the neophytes to provide them a basis for worship corresponding to their phenomenal view of existence. Wise, nonetheless, do not worship Virāṭ-rūpa because it is material.

TEXT 58: THE WORLD IS A PARINĀMA (OR AS A RESULT) OF PARAMĀTMĀ-ŚAKTI

TEXT 58 HAS 4 SUB-SECTIONS (58.1-4)

1) THE TRANS-RATIONAL POWER OF PARAMĀTMĀ

- What is trans-rational? That which is beyond human rational, reasoning, or logic
- JīvaG establishes that the empirical world is not imaginary (**vivarta**) as proposed by the Māyāvāda school, but is real creation of Paramātmā produced thru His external potency, Māyā, and yet the Absolute can inconceivably remain free of any modification in its svarūpa ⇒ This is beyond human rational
- Here the word, Māyā does not mean “ignorance” because ignorance cannot create the universe

2) THE WORLD IS REAL TRANSFORMATION OF PRADHĀNA

- Māyā, as external energy, is inert, but has a conscious aspect because of its presiding deity, Durgā. It is not imaginary because it is a real potency of the Lord.

प्रकृतिर्यस्योपादानामाधारः पुरुषः परः।
सतोऽभिव्यञ्जकः कालो ब्रह्म तत्त्रियं त्वहम्॥

- प्रकृति is the constituting cause (upādāna) of this reality [the universe]; the Supreme Person (पुरुषः परः) is its substratum (ādhāra); and Time is manifestor (अभिव्यञ्जकः). But I am Brahman, which comprehends these three. [11.24.19]

- **JīvaG's explanation:** ∴ the constituting, or phenomenal cause (upādāna) of the universe is sometimes called Brahman and sometimes pradhāna. The modifiable potency (**paramātmāśakti**), called Māyā, is also being twofold—the instrumental part (nimitta), known as Māyā, and the phenomenal part [upādāna, i.e., the constituting ingredients], known as pradhāna. This distinction between the two is that the one that consists of potency alone is instrumental (nimitta), whereas the composed of its emanations is phenomenal (upādāna). Therefore, it is also said in the Upaniṣad that some portion of Māyā is devoid of consciousness.
- That pradhāna undergoes modification (**paramātmā**) is also clearly evident in SB [11.24.19].

■ **Māyāvādī notion:**

- The universe is described as a **vivarta**, an illusory superimposition, or project onto Brahman, which is the only reality.
- The pure self, or ātmā (i.e., Brahman) is different from the Jīva, or the empirical self, which is bound by the laws of karma.
- The universe has no reality of its own, and it is a product of Māyā.
- The word ajñāna, or ignorance is synonymous with Māyā
- Brahman manifests in different ways by the influence of different upādhis, or delimitations

■ **The rope/snake analogy ⇒ two phenomenal transformations:**

- i. In the avidyā, or ignorance, presentation, forming the illusory objective snake phenomenon.
 - ii. In the mind. The Brahman underlying the rope remains the same, but the ignorance of the mind undergoes modification on account of the defect ⇒ the appearance of an illusory snake in the rope (reality), or superimposition.
- This is “**vivarta**, or illusion” from the viewpoint of avidyā

■ JīvaG's resolution:

- The reason universe is described as a **vivarta**, or illusion of Brahman is to create a sense of detachment in the minds of those practicing jñāna, as renunciation is the very basis for the path of knowledge.
- Such a description, however, do not intend to say that universe is illusory or imaginary. Rather, their purpose is to show that the universe factually exists as modification of pradhāna.
- Its being a **vivarta** here means that it is an appearance or manifestation of Paramātmā's energy and not a mere appearance in the Advaitavāda sense.
- The illusion is the superimposition of the “I and mine” in regard to the universe as a whole or in the individual body, onto Paramātmā or the individual self.

3) THE SUPERIMPOSITION IS ILLUSORY BUT NOT THE OBJECTS

- Only an object that exists elsewhere can be superimposed onto something else.
- Because the universe is generated by Paramātmā and is thus not directly He Himself, and because it consists of His external potency Māyā, it is thus not directly related to Him.
- Although the universe is grounded (ādhāra) in the Pure [Paramātmā], He has no direct contact with it.

आत्मा परिज्ञानमयो विवादो ह्यस्तीति नास्तीति भिदार्थनिष्ठः।
व्यर्थोऽपि नैवोपरमेत पुंसां मत्तः परावृत्तधियां स्वलोकात्॥

- “The speculative arguments of philosophers are based upon incomplete knowledge of the Supreme Self and are simply aimed at discerning material dualities. Although such arguments are useless, persons whose attention is diverted away from Me, their own true Self, are unable to give them up.”
[11.22.33]

- The radical Advaitavāda doctrine:
 - The world is not real but an illusory appearance (**vivarta**) of Brahman
 - The analogy of mistaking a rope for snake in semidarkness: The snake is neither real nor unreal: not real because when illuminated, one sees the rope but not a snake; not completely unreal either because one actually does perceive a snake and becomes fearful. The snake = **vivarta** of the rope \Rightarrow the superimposition of a mental pattern or a memory trace of a prior perception of a snake onto the indistinct perception of the rope.
 - The world is actually Brahman, but appears as the world out of ignorance of the perceiver—the process of adhyāropa
- JīvaG's refutation: The imaginary object cannot be superimposed.
 - One must have a subconscious impression of a previously experienced factually existing object. Analogy of a mirage in the desert: Unless one has experienced real water, one cannot have the illusion of water in a mirage.

- In any superimposition, or projection (adhyāropa), both objects must be real. Both rope and snake are real objects existing separately in different locations or times, but the observer mistakenly takes the rope to be a snake. One who has never seen, heard or read about a snake, like a young baby, would never mistake a rope for a snake.
- Superimposition is possible only when there are two objects having separate existence, such as snake and a rope, which a person is then unable to distinguish between. Superimposition is possible in limited objects that have parts. Brahman is all-pervading and w/out any subdivisions, thus there is no possibility of superimposing anything upon it.
- Even the objects perceived in dreams are not false. Dream objects are also the result of memory impressions in the citta. To mistake the universe for Paramātmā or ātmā is an illusion.

4) PARIṆĀMA, NOT VIVARTA, IS THE REAL IMPORT OF ŚĀSTRA

- In describing the principle of the creation, Maitreya Muni speaks of the modification (pariṇāma) of pradhāna ⇒ mahat-tattva

कालवृत्त्या तु मायायां गुणमय्यामधोक्षजः ।

पुरुषेणात्मभूतेन वीर्यमाधत्त वीर्यवान् ॥

ततोऽभवन् महत्तत्त्वमव्यक्तात् कालचोदितात् ।

विज्ञानात्मात्मेहस्थम विश्वं व्यञ्जंस्तमोनुदः ॥

intrinsic potency (वीर्यवान्), placed His seed (वीर्य = the Jīvas) [i.e., His conscious parts] into that Māyā thru the Puruṣa, who is His own self-expansion. Thereafter, the mahat-tattva evolved from the unmanifested state of Māyā, which had been impelled by time. Being of the nature of awareness, it dispels the darkness of ignorance even while manifesting the universe situated within itself [in seed form]” [3.5.26-27] There is no mention of **vivarta** in this description.

“When the equilibrium of the 3 modes that constitute the Māyā potency was displaced by the force of time, the transcendent Bhagavān, who is beyond the senses and endowed with His own

TEXT 59: PARINĀMA AS AN ASPECT OF JÑĀNA

- To instruct Uddhava, Kṛṣṇa recites the dialogue between Dattātreya and King Yadu, which is an instruction on jñāna [11.7.26 – 11.9.31].
- JīvaG quotes just a portion [11.9.16-21]
 - At the end of kalpa, the one Bhagavān Nārāyaṇa, the Supreme Controller, existing alone by Himself w/out a second as the shelter of all and the foundation of the individual self, dissolves this previously created universe thru His own Māyā, by the latter's instrumental power in the form of time. When all the energies in the form of the 3 modes are brought into a balanced state by the Lord's own power of time, the primeval Puruṣa, who is the ruler of both phenomenality (pradhāna) and the individual

conscious beings (puruṣa), who is the supreme goal of both greater and lesser beings and is thus identified as the Supreme Transcendence, continues to exist. He is the totality of unadulterated self-illumination and bliss, devoid of any material designation. O subdue of enemies! Precipitating His Māyā potency consisting of the 3 modes by means of His unique personal power (in the form of time), He first evolves sūtra [1st modification of prakṛti, predominated by rajas] thru her. This (sūtra) is called the manifestation of the 3 modes, which generates the universe of diverse forms, thru which it runs like a thread, and by which the living beings rotate in the cycle of birth and death. Just as a spider manifesting a web from its heart thru the mouth, sports with it and then swallows it, so also the Lord (creates, sustains, and dissolves the universe).

TEXT 60: SAT-KĀRYA-VĀDA

- **Sat-kārya-vāda** is the principle that the effect is part of, and thus non-different from, its cause. However, this does not mean that the effect is exactly the same
 - Analogy: The created clay object is different in name only; only the clay is real.
इदं हि विश्वं भगवानिवेतरो यतो जगत्स्थाननिरोधसम्भवाः ।
तद्धि स्वयं वेदभवांस्तथापि वै प्रादेशमात्रं भवतः प्रदर्शितम् ॥
- Nārada to Vyāsadeva: “This universe is non-different from Bhagavān from whom its sustenance, dissolution, and creation come about, yet [He] is distinct (itara) [from the universe]. [Alternatively, the Jīva who is distinct (itara) from the universe is also non-different from Bhagavān.] You yourself surely know this, but I have nevertheless pointed it out to you in some small measure.” [1.5.20]

PARAMĀTMĀ

- A conscious being—intrinsically endowed with diverse potencies
- The fountainhead of the material universe + the Jīvas within it
- Both the nimitta-cause [by Himself] & upādāna-cause [thru His Māyā potency] of the processes of manifestation & unmanifestation

UNMANIFEST UNIVERSE

- Remains in its subtle form as pradhāna or prakṛti
- the Jīvas w/our their gross or subtle bodies

PARAMĀTMĀ

- Endowed with **SUBTLE** inert & conscious energies

MANIFEST UNIVERSE

- Pradhāna ⇒ mahat-tattva ⇒ ⇒ ⇒ ...earth
- The Jīvas acquire their gross + subtle bodies

PARAMĀTMĀ

- Endowed with **GROSS** inert & conscious energies